Interactive comment on “Study of electron spectral diffusion process under DNP conditions by ELDOR spectroscopy focusing on the $^{14}$N Solid Effect” by Marie Ramirez Cohen et al.

Anonymous Referee #2

Received and published: 11 March 2020

This paper discusses experimentally and theoretically the ELDOR spectrum of TEM-POL solutions in presence of protons and $^{14}$N nuclei. Three different TEMPOL concentrations are considered: 1) At very low concentrations the electron spin of TEMPOL are weakly interacting and the ELDOR spectrum can be computed considering a collection of randomly oriented 3 spin systems (one electron and two nuclei) 2) At very high concentration the ELDOR spectrum is dominated by the electron-electron interaction. A phenomenological model that mimics the spectral diffusion between different electrons reproduce well the experimental data 3) At intermediate concentration the interplay between spectral diffusion and depolarization induced by $^{14}$N solid effect is not correctly described by the model. The paper contains a large amount of work, is well written and should be published. I have few comments: 1) I was not able to clearly find the temperature at which the experiments are performed (20 Kelvin ?). 2) In the introduction the papers Kundu 2018a and Kundu 2018b are cited because they performed quantum mechanical based calculations of the EPR spectra. They found a connection between eSD models and thermal mixing regime. The paper Caracciolo et al (PCCP, 2016, vol. 18, no 36, p. 25655-25662.) should also be cited in this context. 3) Before equation 7c the thermal equilibrium populations should be specified (they are not in the rotating frame)